Division of informatics

University of Edinburgh

Artificial Intelligence Research Methodologies 2000/01

Paper Report Form

Your name: [ ]

The paper: [ ]

Instructions

For each student presentation a paper will be circulated in advance. Read this paper, complete a copy of this form and return it to the module lecturer at the start of the presentation. Your goal is primarily to describe and classify the paper, and only secondarily to evaluate it. Further copies of this form in both, tex and ps form, can be found in:

`dai/courses/ai4/advanced_automated_reasoning/text/review-form.tex/ps`

1 Content of Research

What kind of contribution did the paper attempt to make? Various possible kinds of contribution are listed below. Tick each of those that applies and justify your assessment. Use the comments section for extended discussion.

- [ ] 1. Describes a new technique.
- [ ] 2. Extends or improves an existing technique.
- [ ] 3. Establishes properties of a technique or relations between two or more techniques either empirically or theoretically.
- [ ] 4. Describes a new application of a technique.
- [ ] 5. Tests the psychological validity of a technique.
- [ ] 6. Combines several techniques into a system.
- [ ] 7. Identifies and motivates a new problem.
- [ ] 8. Serves a tutorial role, *e.g.* a survey.
- [ ] 9. Other (please specify).

Comments:

[ ]

2 Correctness and Completeness of Paper

Assess the correctness and completeness of the paper by ticking which of the following apply. Justify your answers in the comments section.

- [ ] 1. The methodology employed by the authors is not sensible.
- [ ] 2. There are major technical errors in the paper.
- [ ] 3. There are major omissions in the paper.
- [ ] 4. The reported research is not in a completed state.
- [ ] 5. Related research is not adequately compared.
- [ ] 6. The paper is deficient in some other way (please specify).

Comments:

3 Significance of Research

Assess the significance of the reported research by answering the following questions. Justify your answers.

1. What hypotheses are tested by the reported research?

2. What are the outcomes of this hypothesis testing?

3. Assess the importance of the reported research on a scale of 1 (trivial) to 5 (major breakthrough).

4 Precis

Describe the message of the paper in your own words. Use 100-200 words.